السلام عليكم

How are you feeling?

Photo by Alireza Zohoor Parvaz on Unsplash
Agenda

1. Checking in
2. Chatterfall
3. Intersections of Equity and Care
4. Ecosystems of Equity and Care
   a. Roumy Cheese
   b. Levels within classroom & institution
5. TRIZ - what stands in our way?
6. Takeaways
These slides are open for commenting at:

Chatterfall

Please respond in the chat
What's an important thing you learned or achieved in the past year?

Image from Pixabay: https://pixabay.com/photos/sunset-rope-swing-girl-silhouette-5737120/
For me - to be useful to others, esp via community-building resources

https://onehe.org/equity-unbound

Image from Pixabay: https://pixabay.com/photos/people-jumping-happiness-happy-fun-821624/
If you were to create a documentary or book about your biggest challenges in 2020, what would it be called?

Image from: https://giphy.com/gifs/cat-book-1TgECF0mNVirC
What is something that has helped you survive or brought you joy the past few months?

https://giphy.com/gifs/mighty-oak-springtime-bees-trees-flowers-bloom-l46CbKqZ1hvJxfZS
Kintsugi (Japanese art) What was broken or damaged during the pandemic? How can we repair or heal it into something more beautiful?

Image by @riho_k on Unsplash
https://unsplash.com/photos/JuDPjcutors
Equity and Care Need to Flourish within an Ecosystem
“Teachers who care, who serve their students, are usually at odds with the environments wherein we teach”

bell hooks, 2003, 
Teaching in Community, p. 91
I'll talk about multiple dimensions, layers, levels, intersections and divergence and convergence
Broad conclusions about equity and care:

(Bali & Zamora, forthcoming)
Equity is multidimensional (Fraser, 2005); oppression is multidimensional (Collins, 2002)
Oppression occurs at multiple levels (4 I’s of oppression), therefore action on equity needs to occur on multiple levels (Gorski)
Care is not monolithic; care can be harmful


Carers can be exploited and require care themselves
There is power in relationships involving care
Equity and care work are incomplete if the recipients of the effort are not themselves empowered to participate fully
Roumy cheese analogy

Original by Ian McKay is about how no “one” mode of preventing spread of infection can protect you against the COVID-19 virus, but multiple together can help “fill the holes” more effectively.
The Swiss Cheese Respiratory Virus Pandemic Defence
recognising that no single intervention is perfect at preventing spread

Each intervention (layer) has imperfections (holes).
Multiple layers improve success.
Diverse Causes of Inequity, Need for Care:
E.g. Racism, xenophobia, coloniality, epistemic injustice

Roumy Cheese Analogy for Caring, Equitable Education

Maha Bali & Leigh-Annec Perryman CC-BY-SA
Adapted from Ian McKay’s virus analogy

Supporting identity & handling bias
Adopting transformative/liberatory pedagogies
decolonising curricula
Culturally Relevant Pedagogy

Black peppercorn represent how some actions meant to promote justice for one group can be harmful for another group
Roumy Cheese Analogy for Caring, Equitable Education

Maha Bali CC-BY-SA
Adapted from Ian McKay’s virus analogy

Diverse Causes of Inequity, Need for Care:
E.g. Racism, classism, heteropatriarchy, ableism, neuronormativity, xenophobia, etc. Can be large (systemic) or small (individual) & intersectional

- Culturally Relevant Pedagogy
- Universal Design for Learning
- Self-mapped Learning Pathways
- Intentionally Equitable Hospitality
- Learner Agency
- Trauma-informed Pedagogy
- Building community in class
- Institutional Policies (P/F, proctoring)
- Other practices?

Black peppercorn represent how some actions meant to promote justice for one group can be harmful for another group
How Do We Center/Embody Care?
Levels of Care & Intentional Equity: **in class**

How do *you* show it at each level?

(see blogpost)

Personal /Private

Respond in Situations

Habitual practices in class

Course philosophy, design, planning
Care with Parity of Participation (Fraser)

"In the caring approach, we would prefer to advise: do unto others as they would have done unto them."
(Noddings)

I say: “Do unto students as THEY would have done unto THEM)

Levels of Care & Intentional Equity: **systemic**

How do *you* embody it at each level?

(see blogpost)

- Advocate for caring, equitable policies institutionally
- Support others, form allyships
- Speak up in situations
- Personal/Private
What is EQUITY without CARE and what is CARE without EQUITY?
No Care

Equity

JUSTICE?
Intentionally Equitable Hospitality?
PARITY OF PARTICIPATION

Systemic Injustice

SYSTEMIC INJUSTICE

SELECTIVE & AFFECTIVE LABOR?
AMELIORATIVE?
PARTIAL?

Tokenism?
Diversity Theater?
Systemic?
Lip Service?
Performative? (Sara Ahmed)

Care

Democratic care (Tronto)

No Care

Inequity

SYSTEMIC INJUSTICE

Selective & Affective Labor?
Ameliorative?
Partial?
Care without Equity:
Caring for others and burning oneself out
(Faculty developers, moms, medical professionals,....)
Care without Equity...

“To do my job well, I invest fully in people. Because I invest fully in people, the university doesn’t—it doesn’t have to. Because the university doesn’t, I invest fully in people. And on and on and on and on.” - Brenna Clarke Gray, p. 52
Care without Equity:
An institution offers “wellbeing” workshops for employees but does nothing to modify work schedules and practices that are creating the stress in the first place.
Care for teachers

- Communities of Teachers
- Care from Students
- Institutional Policies
Equity without Care

“Morality cannot be legislated, but behavior can be regulated. Judicial decrees may not change the heart, but they can restrain the heartless.”

Martin Luther King Jr.
Equity without Care: Can you think of examples of equitable policies that can only be utilized by a few?

Abbey Elder
@OpenAccessElder

Replies to @OpenAccessElder and @Bali_Maha

Equity without care is when the system was changed so that everything *can* work for everyone's needs, but those in charge don't communicate that changes have been made. The equity of the system may only be utilized by a few. In other words, true equity requires a modicum of care.
Care is not an unqualified “good”

When can care be harmful?

(share in chat)
Care with **Parity of Participation**

Parity of Participation

- “Equal partners” with equal power to influence decision-making
- Economic, cultural and political justice

Democratic Care (Tronto, 2015 *Who Cares?*)

“democratic care requires switching perspectives and not just thinking about what we want. We need also to look at care from the standpoint of care-receivers, who will have different ideas about what kind of care they want or need to receive… In a “caring-with” democracy, we can set a goal of structuring institutions and practices so that each person’s individual preferences can be honored.” (Tronto, 2015, p. 34, emphasis in bold added)
How could an institution support or hinder equitable care/compassion by design?
Maida Ali
@maidaali

Replying to @Bali_Maha

For students to finish the courses of Spring 2020, our uni extended the deadlines for work and grade submission by 5 months. It helped the struggling students to integrate back into their routines effectively. They would've failed courses otherwise.

4:43 PM · 08 May 21 · Twitter for Android
We gave students free course extensions with no strings so they could pause studies when COVID first hit. We saw students persist & growth more generally, rather than a wave of withdrawals (our learners are typically older & in work). Care is also a sustainability practice.
Apart from actual initiatives such as device and data provision or accommodations in assessment, a positive for me was responsive and iterative decision making to support students, which prior to pandemic context might have been taken months and years. Hope such agility endures.
Institutions can hinder care/equity
TRIZ: If your goal was to promote an inequitable, uncaring environment, what might you do? (Share in chat)
● How many of the items shared in chat actually resemble practices that occur in our institutions?
● What do we have within our power or influence to change right now?
● What coalitions do we need to make to change these long term?
Emily Regan Wills
@ajnabieh

Replying to @Bali_Maha

B: If a student taking a differentiated exam through our disability services arrives 15 minutes late to that exam, they are not allowed to sit it or reschedule it. Academic accommodations should not make things harder!
Teachers who care about equity and want to avoid online exam proctoring, but accreditation requires students to take invigilated exams to qualify for something.
Community building activities that would center care going forward
Dimensions of Community-building centered on care and equity
“the notion that one model of care will work for everyone is absurd...humans vary in their abilities to give and receive care


Teachers and students vary in their abilities to give and receive care ONLINE! They vary in how they experienced the pandemic and their ability to handle trauma of the pandemic. Context matters!
Values Underpinning the Design

- Intentionally Equitable Hospitality (Bali, Caines, Hogue, DeWaard, Friedrich, 2019)
- Who has access? Whose culture dominates? Who has political power?
- Adaptation by design AND adaptation in the moment. For care and equity
Building community going forward...

- Annotate the Syllabus ([watch Remi Kalir describe](#))
- Survey students ([samples](#))
- Talk about & practice trauma-informed pedagogy ([video by Mays Imad](#) & checklist from Karen Ray Costa)
- Gratitude journaling ([conversation + resources](#))
- Troika consulting ([demo video - promote peer support](#))
- TRIZ ([demo video of this playful innovative problem-solving approach](#))
- Theater of the Oppressed (use body not just face to express)
- Grade in alternative ways (different [approaches + resources](#))
Regularly use warm-up activities
https://onehe.org/equity-unbound/warm-up-activities/
After a year and a half of uncertainty and lack of control over our lives… How much learner agency can we nurture in our classes?
Take Stock Using Ecocycle planning

A Liberating Structure  www.liberatingstructures.com

Influenced by complexity science and agriculture


P.S. to watch a video of us Ecocycling one element of Community Building Resources with Nancy White, see:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IRJ3nymjtGo
Ecocycle Planning

Template adapted from: https://app.mural.co/t/seattleliberatingstructuresi4601/m/seattleliberatingstructuresi4601/1601578665506/ad4b2f41bed07cdf2537654b6221077bde20cf4f
Consider replacing

- “Vision” with “co-created shared vision”
- “incentives” with “participation”
“We need to change the norms of our profession, to centre each other, to celebrate health, to eschew overwork and grind, because if we don’t learn grace, if we don’t reverse course now, nothing will save the academy. If we can’t find a way now to build space for each other, for different kinds of scholars, for different kinds of conversations, we never will” - Brenna Clarke Gray, p. 54
Thank You!


Email: bali@aucegypt.edu

Twitter: @bali_maha


(Some graphics by my daughter, H. Fouad)