

## **A Comparison of Rhetorical Styles in Korean and American Student Writing**

Kyeongja Kim

*University of Wisconsin-Madison*

### **Abstract**

This study compares the rhetorical styles of Korean and American university students' writings through the analyses of the campus newspaper editorials of each country. A total of 30 editorials (10 editorials written in Korean by Korean university students, which were literally translated into English by the author, 10 editorials written in English in Korea by Korean university students, and 10 editorials written in English by American university students) were investigated. The placement of a thesis summary and the topical structures of each editorial were analyzed for the comparison of the differences. Then the writings of Korean ESL students were analyzed to see if they transfer their L1 rhetorical style. Results showed that there was difference in rhetorical styles between the Korean and the American university newspaper editorials and that the Korean ESL students were transferring their L1 rhetorical style into their L2 writing to some degree. Implications of the study for the writing teachers of ESL are discussed.

### **Introduction**

Kaplan (1966), in his article, says that each language and each culture has its own rhetoric pattern unique to itself and that "part of the learning of a particular language is the mastering of its logical system (14)." He says:

Logic which is the basis of rhetoric, is evolved out of a culture; it is not universal. Rhetoric, then, is not universal either, but varies from culture to culture and even from time to time within a given culture. It is affected by canons of taste within a given culture at a given time (2).

He observes many ESL students' writings from various countries and suggests that there are different types of paragraph structures from country to country. For

example, he says, English has a more direct paragraph structure, while some oriental countries have more indirect one, and still other countries have other types of paragraph structures. He takes an example of Korean writing style and says:

... .. the development of the paragraph may be said to be "turning and turning in a widening gyre." The circles or gyres turn around the subject and show it from a variety of tangential views, but the subject is never looked at directly.

Things are developed in terms of what they are not, rather than in terms of what they are (10).

The purpose of this study is to examine his claim through the analysis of the editorials in Korean and American university newspapers. So, the first research questions are: Is there any difference in written discourse patterns between Korean and American university newspaper editorials? If so, what is the difference between them?

After the analyses of the editorials, this study also examines the writings of Korean ESL students to see if Korean ESL students studying in the U.S. transfer their L1 (Korean) rhetorical patterns into their L2 (English) writing.

## Procedure

### Data

First, 30 university newspaper editorials from three different sources, which were chosen randomly, were collected. They are as follows:

- a. 10 Editorials written in Korean in Korea by Korean university students  
(*Edae Hakbo, Sogang Hakbo, and Chungdae Shinmoon*)
- b. 10 Editorials written in English in Korea by Korean university students  
(*The Sogang Herald and the Chung Ang Herald*)
- c. 10 Editorials written in English in the U.S. by American university students  
(*The Badger Herald and The Daily Cardinal*)

The data in 'a,' the 10 Korean editorials were translated into English by the author. They were literally translated so that the translation might not affect the original meaning of each sentence and so that we could find the right and the same topics as those of original sentences. The reason why the editorials written in English in Korea by Korean university students are included is to see whether there is difference between editorials written in Korean by Korean students and those written in English by Korean students.

Then, for the analysis of the Korean ESL students' writing, 8 essays from Korean students, who attend the ESL program in one of the American universities, were collected. The data were collected both from class assignments and from their journals (4 from class assignments and 4 from their journals). The students were also asked to fill out the questionnaires for their English and writing backgrounds.

## Method

First, the editorials were compared in terms of the placement of a thesis summary. In analyzing the placement of a thesis summary, I referred to Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen (1989). And then to see the difference between Korean and American students' rhetorical styles, I analysed topical structures of each editorial. Since Kaplan (1966) said English had more direct paragraph structure and that the development of paragraphs in Korean writings was more like "turning and turning in a widening gyre (10)," I thought that if I could draw diagrams of the arrangements of sentence topics, employing topical structure analysis, I might be able to find something relevant to what he said.

After analyzing and getting results from 30 editorials, I analyzed 8 Korean ESL students' writings. Since the genre of the ESL students' writings is different from that of the editorials, I analyzed the placement of the main idea of the ESL students' writings instead of a thesis summary. Except that, I analyzed the writings in the same way as I did in the analyses of editorials. The results were compared with those of editorials.

## Analysis of editorials

### *(1) Analysis of the placement of a thesis summary*

In general, we do not argue for a shared opinion or what is taken for granted, but only about a position we assume the reader does not share. According to Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen (1989), the term "thesis" refers to "the opinions, views and positions argued for in the editorials" (174) and "a thesis summary" is defined as "a sentence or a complex of sentences in which the opinion or position, i.e., thesis argued for in the article is expressed at a general level" (175). They suggest two requirements for qualification of a thesis summary: (1) "it must constitute a thesis" and (2) "it must summarise the theses expressed in the article" (175).

To decide whether a statement is a thesis or a statement of fact is not easy. Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen (1989) suggest that if it is a thesis, "it is argued for in the text" (175). They say the headline in an editorial is usually the indicator of a thesis. They code a thesis as a thesis summary if that thesis is entailed by other theses in the text. This is because several researchers such as Tomlin (1985), Van Dijk (1980), and Grimes (1975) prefer generality to specific. So, they consider that the main thesis (i.e. thesis statement) is expressed in the thesis summary.

In addition to theses, there are concluding stages of the article, which are usually expressed at the end of an editorial. In Korean writing style, this is usually the most important part and the main focus is usually expressed here.

I define "initial placement" of a thesis summary as its appearing within the first third of the article, according to Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen's (1989) definition. One of the reasons of this is to see whether one of their findings that

English newspaper editorials tend to have initial thesis summary is true to American university newspaper editorials, too. According to Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen's (1989), initial placement is not usually the first paragraph of the article since the article often begins with a brief orientation, or description of a situation before it comes to the main thesis.

Since it is not easy to decide a thesis summary in an article, I'll show an example from Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen's (1989). The following illustration of a thesis summary is from *The Observer* headlined with "The unacceptable face of Thatcherism" (177):

- (1) If it were just a matter of the ever-running Westland saga, it might be understandable, although none the less obnoxious. But it isn't just a matter of one incident. The Westland roman candle has lit up a whole landscape of behaviour, in the City as much as in the Cabinet, and it is not an attractive sight.
- (2) The City is embarked on the greatest take-over spree in its history, surpassing even the heyday of Jimmy Slater and his merry band of asset strippers.
- (3) The sight of companies being tossed around and shares being manipulated to make millions for individuals is a strange one to present during this Industry Year 1986.

According to them, (1) expresses the thesis of the article at a more general level - overall criticism of Thatcher's government. They say *it is not an attractive sight* in (1) can be a signal of an opinion and that (2) and (3) specify and justify the main thesis.

In the next example from *Helsingin Sanomat*, one of Finnish newspapers, headlined with "Finland and Israel," they show what can not be a thesis summary (178):

- (4) Now that the formalities have been fulfilled, relations can be said to have been restored to normality.
- (5) Since Finland is in turn proud of its contribution in the Unifil, there is an element of tension left in the (Finnish-Israeli) relations, in spite of the fact that the hostage drama was settled satisfactorily.

According to them, (4) can not be a thesis summary since it is not entailed by subsequent theses (5). Another example, which is shown below, from *Helsingin Sanomat*, headlined with "The rise and fall of Norway's oil" shows that it does not qualify as a thesis summary since, according to them, it has "a positive evaluation which is presented as a fact and on which agreement is assumed to be shared" (178). That is, it is not argued for:

- (6) The redeeming feature in the Norwegian crisis is that most of the oil income was not allowed to be spent on welfare in spite of pressures in that direction. The money was wisely used to pay back government debts.

Thus Norway has no debts now. This is a considerable advantage at a time when the current account surplus of 30 thousand million crowns is threatening to turn into a deficit.

I used these guidelines in analyzing my data. The following examples show how I analyzed the data:

Example 1. An editorial by American students: the first three paragraphs from *The Badger Herald* (Monday August 27, 1990) with no headline:

- (1) Welcome to the pages of *The Badger Herald*. You, and others like you in the University of Wisconsin community, are about to witness a significant departure in the history of student journalism on the Madison campus. Since April 4, 1892, there has been one newspaper here, and that newspaper, in spite of its official status, has considered itself "independent." It has made all sorts of moves in recent years designed to strengthen that contention.
- (2) But there has been one big flaw in the running of "The Official Student Newspaper of the University of Wisconsin," and that has been its monopoly status. The basic human drive for competition has been by default directed at the university administration, rather than at a competing newspaper, and their result, in the judgement of many, has been mediocrity at best, and demagoguery at worst.
- (3) Seventy-seven years is enough. It is time there was a truly 'independent' student newspaper at Wisconsin, one which competes in the open market-place, and must make its editorial and business decisions on the basis of that competitive market. A newspaper is not truly worthy of the name until it is clear of the artificially protective and restrictive atmosphere of "official student newspaper" status.

Here, paragraph (1) can be considered as a thesis summary since it is entailed and justified by paragraphs (2) and (3). The sentence *You, and others like you in the University of Wisconsin community, are about to witness a significant departure in the history of student journalism on the Madison campus* in paragraph (1) can be seen as a signal of an opinion. Paragraph (2) presents the problem of the existing "The Official Student Newspaper of the University of Wisconsin" and paragraph (3) reinforces the claim presented in paragraph (1) by giving more specific details to what is claimed in paragraph (1). That is, paragraphs (2) and (3) support the thesis of this article which appears in paragraph (1). So, we can say that this article has an initial placement of a thesis summary.

Example 2. An editorial written in Korean by Korean students: the first four paragraphs from *Chungdae Shinmoon* (Monday, June 5, 1995) with the headline,

"No Donation Admission (to a university)," which is literally translated into English by the author (note: 'donation admission' is a kind of special admission to a university, in which an applicant who or whose parents contribute(s) certain amounts of money to a university can be admitted without entrance examination. In Korea it has been prohibited by law.):

- (1) The education reform bill which the Education Reform Committee established, in conclusion, is only 'a tree without roots.' Leaving the content of the reform of elementary, junior and senior high schools unmentioned, the arrangement of 'university autonomy' lacks the core of the problem, the plan for financial expansion.
- (2) In this situation of the university, the plan for financial resources is the most important pending problem. As if they reflect this, people raise arguments for or against the 'donation admission' right after the announcement of the Education Reform Committee.
- (3) Since the Education Reform Committee announced that 'as there is no legal restriction, each university should decide whether or not to accept the 'donation admission,' this, in fact, means that the 'donation admission' is possible if a university wants it. The Education Reform Committee says this is part of the arrangement of university autonomy. In fact, some universities, including Sogang University and Dongkuk University, express the intention of allowing 'donation admission' and they make 'contribution admission' and 'special case admission,' which are the changed forms of 'donation admission,' a public opinion.
- (4) One of the reasons why some universities make 'donation admission' a subject of discussion as a way of solving the problem of financial resources results from the fact that there is no actual plan (for financial resources) itself since the education reform bill announced the postponement of 'security of 5% of for educational finance.' In addition, there are conflicting opinions between the Education Reform Committee and the Economic Planning Board about whether to include tuition in educational finance. Up to the present, there are arguments between 'disallowance' (of 'donation admission') position of the Board of Education and 'a bread-and- butter' theory of the university. However, the Education Reform Committee already left room for discussion of 'donation admission' and also they show the fact that there is no plan for financial expansion, either.

There seems to be no thesis statement until the fourth paragraph. From the headline, "No Donation Admission (to a university)," the readers who are accustomed to the American writing style may expect that the thesis will be something about opposition to 'donation admission' and that it will appear at the beginning of the article.

Still, as we see above, the first four paragraphs do not show the thesis summary. We may consider the sentence *Leaving the content of the reform of elementary, junior and senior high schools unmentioned, the arrangement of 'university autonomy' lacks the core of the problem, the plan for financial expansion* in paragraph (1) or the sentence *As if they reflect this, people raise arguments for or against the 'donation admission' right after the announcement of the Education Reform Committee* in paragraph (2) as a signal of an opinion. But neither of them is supported by the next paragraphs. Rather, the thesis statement appears almost at the end of the article, in paragraph (8), which is shown below. So, we can say that this article does not have an initial placement of a thesis summary.

- (5) This is the very reason why we suspect that the announcement of the education reform bill is part of 'generous' administration preparing for the election of local bodies of local self-governments.
- (6) In the situation in which the education reform bill, which was announced about a month later than the expected time for announcement, did not include any concrete plan for finance supply, and in which there are continuous debate about whether to include tuition in the educational finance, it is also only doubtful whether the bill will be prepared by the end of the September as the government promised.
- (7) Seeing the present education reform bill, we strongly insist the followings.
- (8) The Board of Education and the people in charge of education should make their position clear so that they can get rid of the confusion resulting from the present debate for 'donation admission. There can never be 'donation admission.'
- (9) In addition to this, the plan for securing 5% of GNP for educational finance should be arranged at once. Do announce the plan for finance expansion first if the government wants to make the education reform bill responsible one.

Here, we see that the way of presenting thesis statement is different from that of *The Badger Herald*. Instead of putting the thesis statement at the beginning of the article and making the next paragraphs support it, the Korean students put it almost at the end of the article after long 'orientation.' 'Orientation' here means what Scarcella (1984) says "words which preceded the introduction of the thesis statement," (675) where the 'thesis statement' is defined as a "statement which introduced the 'significant change' about which the subjects in the study had been asked to write" (675). It is also noticeable that the Korean students present several 'facts' first to induce the thesis statement rather than make arguments to support it.

Example 3. An editorial written in Korean by Korean students: the whole article from *Edae Hakbo* (September 5, 1994) with the headline, "Start the Environment

Movement within the Campus," which is literally translated into English by the author:

- (1) Any Ewhaer (note: "Ewha" is the name of the university from which this editorial comes) who has returned to the campus after a long vacation must have been surprised to see so many changes which happened in the campus during the last summer.
- (2) Besides the conspicuous new building of College of Pharmacy and remodeling of the back entrance gate, almost all the buildings in our university, including the Graduate School building, the Science building, the Student building, the College of Education building, the Art building, and the Music building and so on, went through remodeling or improvement work of the inside of the buildings.
- (3) In case of the Student building, they put double-glassed windows on the side of the road so that they could keep the noise away, and put air conditioners for heating and cooling rooms. The department rooms in the basement, for which everybody wanted a bigger one since their sizes were different, are also changed into nice rooms of the same sizes with walls and windows remodeled. The bathrooms are also remodeled into and clean ones, and the trash cans for recycling, which the cooperative union gave at the proper time, well matched the cleaned hallway.
- (4) The reason why we have the impression that we entered the new buildings is not only due to the newly painted walls but to the improvement of desks and chairs of the classrooms. We thank the school for making efforts to improve the environment and for the people who gave their labor while it was terribly hot during the summer.
- (5) However, we want to take this opportunity to make some pledges for the environment of our university.
- (6) Most of all, we worry how long indeed these clean walls, desks, and chairs will last. Should we fine for the scribbling on the desks, or for the disordered and illegal stickers and papers on the bulletin boards or on the walls? In addition to these, there are innumerable cases in which we can not but blame the insensibility of our fellow students. The shame we feel when we see the trash thrown away beside the trash cans in the library lounges or in the student lounges, the empty boxes piled up near the school store since they didn't get rid of them at a proper time. It is especially undesirable, looking at it in the sense of the waste of energy, for us to leave the fluorescent lamps turned on all through the day in the empty classrooms.

- (7) Another thing is the campus which is getting smaller and smaller. We know that the school authorities have considered it very carefully, but, even if we are happy with the new College of Pharmacy building on one hand, we can not but feel sad on the other hand since the green land in the campus is getting smaller that much. The campus of our university is especially beautiful since it has many trees and green grass. We sincerely hope that the extension or remodeling work will be done without destroying the green land any more.
- (8) However, the spatial environment is not the only environment. Even if the noise from outside is kept away, there is no way of keeping students from making noise in the hallway during the lecture in the classroom. Should we put slogans saying 'Let's be quiet in the hallway!' on every hallway? Let's not forget the fact that the very beginning of environment movement is the beauty of intelligence in which we should be conscious others and try not to disturb them. Only the intelligence which acts in small things can achieve the bigger ones.

This editorial also does not have a thesis summary at an initial position of the article. Here, too, rather implicit thesis statement appears at the end of the article. Instead of putting explicit thesis statement at the initial part of the article with the next paragraphs supporting it, they put long orientation first, with several 'facts' listed, and induce the thesis statement at the end of the article.

Example 4. An editorial written in English by Korean students: the whole article from *The Sogang Herald* (December 9, 1993) with the headline, "'Unfair' global trade"

- (1) As pressure to open market grows, Korea loses confidence in battling against the Western giants. It appears that the demand of trade liberalization is influenced greatly without exception.
- (2) Since the departure, the government has said to adhere to open anything but the rice-market seemed to change its attitude. Rice is considered vital for the existence of the farm industry. Farming plays an important role not only to supply substantial food but to preserve the national culture. If the government gives up the rice farming, it would open up the domestic markets 14 other farm products as well.
- (3) Regarding the trade liberalization, twenty nine countries including France, Japan, Swiss and Canada still adhere to limit their import items. Not only that, the United States has limited their import limitations to 14 items.
- (4) President, Clinton said that the only way for all countries to be wealthy is to expand global growth and to expand each country's fair share of

global trade. At the same time, the policy of the United States aims only to fulfill their interests not in maintaining 'fair share of global trade.' South Korea has become one of its victims. Grouping Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, the United States and South Korea are not on cooperative terms. There is only pressure from one side.

- (5) If the opening of market is inevitable in order to avoid economic isolation and to maintain ties with the international community, various precautions should be taken before opening. When countermeasures are reasonable and acceptable to domestic farmers, people will not object.
- (6) While 'rumors' that the government will open the rice-market gradually are in the air, the President is busy only avoiding his responsibility. At first, he ought to reveal the truth and address his policy to farmers assertively. It is also important to listen to people's voice. As the Uruguay Round trade negotiations deadline of December 15 nears, the Blue House should not yield to the pressures of the Western giants, giving up economic sovereign. The President is asked to show a responsible attitude.

From the title, we may expect that the thesis in this article would be argument about 'unfair' global trade' and it seems to appear in paragraph (4). Or we may say paragraph (1) can be a thesis summary. But neither of them is entailed or supported by the next paragraphs and so this article also doesn't have thesis summary in the initial position. Rather, the thesis statement seems to appear in the last paragraph. In fact, the main point which the writer wants to make in this article is that "the President should listen to people's voice" and show the people clear and responsible attitude, "not yielding to the pressures of the Western giants, giving up even economic sovereign," which appears in the last paragraph (6).

Example 5. An editorial written in English by Korean students: the whole article from *The Chung-Ang Herald* (February, 1996) with the headline, "Undergoing Change"

- (1) The world really seems to be changing. Nothing seems to stay in the same state or condition for not changing is even stranger nowadays. Look around and see. Probably the trees or the sky still happens to be where it was yesterday but the truth is that even nature is changing. The sky we see today will not be the same after a few months. Examine the sky carefully and recall the sky of a few years ago. Its color is graying day by day. Yes, everything is undergoing somehow to turn into something else.
- (2) Changes occur in two ways. One is made to be while others take place because of one's willingness. Here we will deal with the latter. What

does change really mean then? Is it reform? Usually one changes to move forward, in the positive direction. From time to time change is development' at others it is reformation and sometimes both.

- (3) Let me give you an example of change. When asked to give the name of the most favored daily newspaper, most of the young generation will call out, '*The Han-kyreh Shinmun*.' The cause of its popularity is because it represents the young. Most of the articles are rather anti-governmental and deal with issues taken for granted such as the isolated people. It has a strong viewpoint that can point out the wrong. It was an attempt which was able to criticize the wrongs of the government on the people's side.
- (4) It didn't last long however. Pick up the newspaper and have a look at it. It is no different from the other papers. The colorful full page advertisements, wasteful space killers such as daily novel installments or "this week's reader" column are just a few of the examples.
- (5) Newspapers are eager to publish more number of papers forgetting the essential. The role of the press is what they really need to be worrying. Someone will argue that this is the only possible way to survive in a capitalistic society but they are plainly excuses. The duty of the press is to inform current news promptly and accurately leading the people to the correct direction. Certainly amusement can be inserted to give fun and entertainment to the readers. However this must not be the main issue dealt in the papers like in most cases.
- (6) Knowing the essential seems to be the most important part to accomplish. How will you describe the people of today? People are at a loss. We cannot even figure out what is right or wrong. This is because we lack the essential. Everyone is trying to find about his/her ideology and stick to it. Sometimes religion helps but it is not always the answer.
- (7) Things are apt to change but the essential must not. Every product whether it is a material or not has an essential object. Without it, they have no meaning to exist further on. It is time to set down and rethink about the basic object of the things around us. Or do we rather have to change the essentials?

This editorial also doesn't have thesis summary at the initial place of the article. From the title, and from reading the first few paragraphs, readers may expect that the article would be something about 'change.' On the contrary, however, the main point which the writer wants to make in this article is about 'essential' and that topic appears only at the end of the article, making a thesis summary such as paragraph (7).

I analyzed the placement of a thesis summary with a total of 30 editorials and the

result is as follows:

placement of a thesis summary	initial	middle	end	
Total				
editorials written in Korean by Korean students	1	1	8	10
editorials written in English by Korean students	0	1	9	10
editorials written in English by American students	7	1	2	10

(2) Analysis of the topical structure

The best way of looking at how people organize their ideas in writings may be to analyze the way they arrange sentence topics. Sentence topics are closely related to the coherence of a text. According to Phelps (1985), coherence is defined as "the experience of meaningfulness correlated with successful integration during reading, which the reader projects back into the text as a quality of wholeness in its meanings" (21).

Lautamatti (1987) says a text must be a meaningful whole to form a coherent piece of discourse. She says:

We expect sequences making up a piece of discourse to be related, however indirectly, to the main idea discussed, here referred to as *discourse topic*. This relation may be direct, especially in short texts, or indirect, based on the development of subordinate ideas, *sub-topics*, which in their turn relate to the discourse topic. The development of the discourse topic within an extensive piece of discourse may be thought of in terms of succession of hierarchically ordered sub-topics, each of which contributes to the discourse topic, and is treated as a sequence of ideas, expressed in the written language as sentences. We know little about restrictions concerning the relationship between sentences and sub-topics, but it seems likely that most sentences relating to the same sub-topic form a sequence. The way the written sentences in discourse relate to the discourse topic and its sub-topics is here called *topical development of discourse* (87).

Witte (1983) refers to the Lautamatti's (1987) term, "sub-topics" as "sentence topics." He says Lautamatti's (1987) view of the relationship of sub-topics (i.e., sentence topics)

to the discourse topic overcomes the problems of "using the orthographic boundaries of sentences and paragraphs as the principal semantic or meaning markers in extended discourse" (318). In coherent texts, he says, semantic relationships are expressed through sequences of sentences, and these sequences of sentences contribute to the discourse topic by developing a succession of sentence topics, sequences which Lautamatti (1987) calls "topical progressions."

According to Witte (1983), discourse topic is "a topic which controls or governs the meaning of the topics of individual sentences" (316). It is not explicitly stated in the text itself but derived from "the interaction of the text with the reader's prior knowledge" (316). Writing about the relationship between discourse topic and sentence topic, Witte (1983) suggests that "sentence topics are seen as units of meaning organized hierarchically in the text" (318).

Lautamatti (1987) analyzes the relation of "topic" and "comment" in sentences. Topic is what the sentence is about - the main idea of the sentence - and comment is what is said about the topic. Topic often coincides with the grammatical subject of the sentence and is usually a noun or noun phrase, but mostly the sentence topics are determined by the context, as we see from the following examples, where the sentence topics are italicized (Cerniglia, Medsker, and Connor, 1990:235-236):

- (1) *Dorm life* is not as drab as I had first imagined.
- (2) *The briefcase* bulged with unfinished paperwork so that the seams nearly split open.
- (3) There are many *changes* coming to Purdue from such a small town like Danville, Indiana.
- (4) It seemed as if *her work* would never be finished.
- (5) Although *Bob and Alice* were unfair and cruel parents, their daughter still took care of them (Cerniglia, Medsker, and Connor say *parents* also can be the sentence topic).
- (6) Although Purdue and Owen Hall are wonderful place to be at times, they also have their *disadvantages*.

Topics can appear in other places in the sentence, depending on context. Connor (1990) shows the following examples in which "the initial word fills the subject position and signals that the topic will be expressed later in the sentence" (424, note 3), where sentence topics are italicized:

- (a) Cleft sentence: It is the *scientist* who ensures that everyone reaches his office on time.
- (b) Anticipatory pronoun *it*: It is well known that *a society* benefits from the work of its members.
- (c) Existential *there*: There often exists in our society *a certain dichotomy* of art and science.
- (d) Introductory phrases such as *I believe, I think, or we can see*: I believe that

*art and science* sustain and support each other.

In more detail, Lautamatti (1987) presents the following 5 types of topical structure (Witte (1983) explains those 5 types, using Lautamatti's (1978) suggestion. I quote the following text, where the sentence topics are italicized, and the illustrations of the 5 types from Witte (1983)):

- (1) When *a human infant* is born into any language community in any part of the world, it has two things in common with every other infant, provided neither of them has been damaged in any way either before or during birth. (2) Firstly, and most obviously, *new born children* are completely helpless. (3) Apart from a powerful capacity to draw attention to their helplessness by using sound, there is nothing *the new born child* can do to ensure his own survival. (4) Without care from some other human being or beings, be it a mother, grandmother, sister, nurse, or human group, *a child* is very unlikely to survive. (5) *This helplessness of human infant* is in marked contrast with the capacity of many new born animals to get to their feet within minutes of birth and run with the herd within a few hours. (6) Although *young animals* are certainly at risk, sometimes for weeks or even months after birth, compared with human infants they very quickly develop the capacity to fend for themselves. (7) It would seem that *this long period of vulnerability* is the price that the human species has to pay for the very long period which fits man for survival as a species. (8) It is during this very long period in which *the human infant* is totally dependent on others that it reveals the second feature which it shares with all other undamaged human infants, a capacity to learn language. (9) For this reason, biologists now suggest that *language* is "species specific" to the human race, which means they consider the human infant to be programmed in such a way that it can acquire language. (10) This suggestion implies that just as *human beings* are designed to see three-dimensionally and in colour, and just as they are designed to stand up-right rather than to move on all fours, so are they designed to learn and use language as part of their normal development as well-formed human beings.

Type 1 (e.g. (5) above): the grammatical subject, the initial sentence element, and the topical subject are identical

Type 2 (e.g. (2) and (4) above): the initial sentence element differs from the grammatical subject and the topical subject, which are themselves identical

Type 3 (e.g. (7), (8), and (10) above): the grammatical subject and the initial sentence element are the same, but both differ from the topical subject

Type 4 (e.g. (1) and (6) above): the topical subject coincides with the initial sentence element and the grammatical subject which differs from both

Type 5 (e.g. (3) and (9) above): the initial sentence element, the topical subject, and the grammatical subject all differ.

But, still, to decide the sentence topic in a sentence is difficult and it tends to be subjective to the researcher's view, which may affect the reliability of the study. Witte (1983) mentions the procedure according to which he decides a sentence topic as follows, which I followed to decide the sentence topics of my data:

In coding the texts, I first read each in its entirety. This gave me a sense of what each text was about. With this sense (and I admit that texts which are not well-formed are often ambiguous and therefore susceptible to multiple interpretations), I then analyzed individual sentences for their topics, seeking an answer to the question, "What is this sentence about?" I moved from one noun phrase to the next until I found what I thought was a satisfactory answer for each sentence in the context of the whole discourse (341: note 50).

In topical structure analysis, researchers look at sequences of sentences and examine how the sentence topics work through the text to progressively build meaning. There are three types of progression: parallel, sequential, and extended parallel progression. According to Witte (1983), in parallel progression, successive sentences have the same sentence topics, i.e., "the *topics* of the various sentences are referentially identical, using repeated lexical items, synonyms, near-synonyms, or pronouns" (319); in sequential progression, the sentence topics are always different, and the comment part of the previous sentence often becomes the topic of the following sentence; and the extended parallel progression is "a parallel progression which is temporarily interrupted by a sequential progression" (319).

Connor and Schneider (1990) say the parallel progression, which is repetition of a topic, reinforces an idea in the reader's mind and that sequential progression can help develop an idea and contribute to the coherence of a text since it adds details to a topic. But, they say, if it does not relate to the previous sentence topic or to overall discourse topic of the text, it will detract from coherence. The extended parallel progression, where the writer returns to a topic mentioned earlier, according to them, brings the reader back to the main idea and reminds the reader of important topics and it often indicates a closure when it occurs at the end of a text.

I used t-units as the unit of analysis instead of sentences. Because t-units distinguish between simple sentences and compound sentences, they provide a more valid basis of comparison. I have used the following definitions of t-units provided by Connor and Schneider (1990):

1. Any independent clause and all its required modifiers.
2. Any non-independent clause punctuated as a sentence (as indicated by end punctuation).
3. Any imperative.

I followed the above guidelines in analyzing my data. The procedures in which I

analyzed the topical structure are as follows: (1) to identify t-unit topics, (2) to determine the progression of t-unit topics, and (3) to make charts of the progression of topics. The followings are the examples of the analyses of my data, where t-units are numbered and t-unit topics are italicized:

Example 1. An editorial by American students: the whole article from *The Badger Herald* (Monday August 27, 1990) with no headline

(1) *Welcome* to the pages of *The Badger Herald*. (2) You, and others like you in the University of Wisconsin community, are about to witness *a significant departure* in the history of student journalism on the Madison campus. (3) Since April 4, 1892, there has been but *one newspaper* here, (4) and *that newspaper*, in spite of its official status, has considered itself "independent." (5) *It* has made all sorts of moves in recent years designed to strengthen that contention.

(6) But there has been *one big flaw* in the running of "The Official Newspaper of the University of Wisconsin," (7) and *that* has been its monopoly status. (8) *The basic human drive* for competition has been by default directed at the university administration, rather than at a competing newspaper, (9) and *their result*, in the judgement of many, has been mediocrity at best, and demagoguery at worst.

(10) *Seventy-seven years* is enough. (11) It is time there was *a truly 'independent' student newspaper* at Wisconsin, one which competes in the open market- place, and must make its editorial and business decisions on the basis of that competitive market. (12) *A newspaper* is not truly worthy of the name until it is clear of the artificially protective and restrictive atmosphere of "official student newspaper" status.

(13) With true independence comes *added responsibility*, and *item* which need not be given significant attention when a student has nowhere else to turn for campus news. (14) *This newspaper* will try to exercise responsibility, and will thus make a sincere effort to cover a variety of news, not just that of interest to the student of social science. (15) *This* is not to say that material of a political nature is of only moderate importance. (16) *I* does mean that there is a *legitimate news* happening everywhere on campus, not just on Bascom Hill.

(17) *The search for legitimate and relevant news* does not stop, either, with the political agitation of activists on the left. (18) *A basic flaw* in the entire educational structure at the University of Wisconsin is a total dedication to problem-solving along the "liberal" or "radical" lines.

(19) *This paper*, on its editorial page, will give some attention to what sometimes considered "conservative," but more accurately termed "libertarian approaches to attacking the many severe problems which plague our society. (20) Perhaps in this way *we* can help stimulate some serious thought and careful introspection by

those who consider themselves "intellectual," but to date have really only devoted their "thought" to one set of alternatives.

(21) *The rest of the paper*, though, should be worthy of being called "News," (22) and *it* must not be sheer propaganda. (23) *Whether or not it is construed as such by the reader* is partly dependent upon the material itself, and partly upon the perspective of the reader. (24) *We* will do our best, and welcome suggestions from anyone.

(25) *We* welcome, too, those who are interested in staff positions with *Badger Herald*. (26) *Phone or drop in* at the *Herald* office.

(27) *This newspaper* is an experiment. (28) *We* are attempting to do that which has never been done before. (29) To succeed in that experiment, *we* must have support of all who believe in what we are doing.

(30) *The monopoly* has ended.

#### Topical structure analysis

	No. of topics
1. Welcome	1
2. a significant departure	2
3. one newspaper	3
4. that newspaper	3
5. It	3
6. on big flaw	4
7. that	4
8. The basic human drive	5
9. their result	5
10. Seventy-seven years	6
11. a truly 'independent' student newspaper	6
12. A newspaper	7
13. added responsibility, and item	8
14. This newspaper	8
15. This	9
16. a legitimate news	10
17. The search for legitimate and relevant news	11
18. A basic flaw	12
19. This paper	12
20. We	12
21. The rest of the paper	12
22. it 12	
23. Whether or not it is construed as such	13
24. We	13

Kyeongja Kim

25. We		13
26. Phone or drop		14
27. This newspaper		14
28. We		14
29. we		14
30. The monopoly		14

<u>Parallel</u>		<u>Sequential</u>		<u>Extended Parallel</u>	
3,4	4,5	1,2	2,3	2,11	11,14
6,7	8,9	5,6	7,8	14,19	22,24
19,20	20,21	9,10	11,12	25,27	6,30
21,22	24,25	12,13	14,15		
27,28	28,29	15,16	16,17		
		17,18	22,23		
		25,26			
<u>Total</u>		<u>Total</u>		<u>Total</u>	
10		13		6	

In this article, the total number of different t-unit topics is 14 out of 30 t-units. The more the article contains parallel progressions and extended parallel progressions, the smaller the number of t-unit topics would be. Also, this article contains 10 parallel progressions, 13 sequential progressions, and 6 extended parallel progressions out of a total of 29 progressions.

Example 2. An editorial written in Korean by Korean students: the whole article from *Chungdae Shinmoon* (June 5, 1995) with the headline, "No Donation Admission (to a university)," which is literally translated into English by the author:

(1) *The education reform bill* which the Education Reform Committee established, in conclusion, is only 'a tree without roots.' (2) Leaving the content of reform of elementary, junior and senior high schools unmentioned, *the arrangement 'university autonomy'* lacks the core of the problem, the plan for financial expansion.

(3) In this situation of the university, *the plan for financial resources* is the most important pending problem. (4) As if they reflect this, people raise *arguments* for or against the 'donation admission' right after the announcement of the Education Reform Committee.

(5) Since the Education Reform Committee announced that 'as there is no legal restriction, each university should decide whether or not to accept the 'donation admission,' this, in fact, means that '*donation admission*' is possible if a university wants it. (6) The Education Reform Committee says *this* is part of the arrangement

of university autonomy. (7) In fact, *some universities*, including Sogang University and Dongkuk University, express the intention of allowing 'donation admission' (8) and they make '*contribution admission*' and '*special case admission*,' which are the changed forms of 'donation admission,' a public opinion.

(9) *One of the reasons* why some universities make 'donation admission' a subject of discussion as a way of solving the problem of financial resources results from the fact that there is no actual plan (for financial resources) itself since the education reform bill announced the postponement of 'security of 5% of GNP for educational finance.'

(10) In addition, there are *conflicting opinions* between the Education Reform Committee and the Economic Planning Board about whether to include tuition in educational finance. (11) Up to the present, there are *arguments* between 'disallowance' (of 'donation admission') position of the Board of Education and 'a bread-and- butter' theory of the university. (12) However, the Education Reform Committee already left *room for discussion* of 'donation admission' (13) and also they show the fact that there is *no plan for financial expansion*, either.

(14) This is the very reason why we suspect that the announcement of education reform bill is part of '*generous*' *administration* preparing for the election of local bodies of local self-governments.

(15) In the situation in which the education reform bill, which was announced about a month later than the expected time for announcement, did not include any concrete plan for finance supply, and in which there are continuous debate about whether to include tuition in the educational finance, it is only doubtful whether *the bill* will be prepared by the end of the September as the government promised.

(16) Seeing the present education reform bill, *we* strongly insist the followings.

(17) *The Board of Education and the people in charge of education* should make their position clear so that they can get rid of the confusion resulting from the present debate for 'donation admission. (18) There can never be '*donation admission*.'

(19) In addition to this, *the plan for securing 5% of GNP* for educational finance should be arranged at once. (20) Do announce *the plan for financial expansion* first if the government wants to make the education reform bill responsible one.

<u>Topical structure analysis</u>	Number of topics
1. The education reform bill	1
2. the arrangement of 'university autonomy'	2
3. the plan for financial resources	3
4. arguments for or against the 'donation admission'	4
5. 'donation admission'	5
6. this	5
7. some universities	6
8. 'contribution admission' and 'special case admission'	7

Kyeongja Kim

9.	One of the reasons	8
10.	conflicting opinions	9
11.	arguments	10
12.	room for discussion	11
13.	no plan for financial expansion	12
14.	'generous' administration	13
15.	the bill 13	
16.	we	14
17.	The Board of Education and the people	15
18.	'donation admission'	15
19.	the plan for securing 5% of GNP	16
20.	the plan for financial expansion	16

<u>Parallel</u>	<u>Sequential</u>	<u>Extended Parallel</u>
5,6	1,2    2,3	1,15
	3,4    4,5	6,18
	6,7    7,8	13,20
	8,9    9,10	
	10,11   11,12	
	12,13   13,14	
	15,16   16,17	
	18,19	
 <u>Total</u>	 <u>Total</u>	 <u>Total</u>
1	15	3

Example 3. An editorial written in Korean by Korean students: the whole article from *Edae Hakbo* (September 5, 1994) with the headline, "Start the Environment Movement within the Campus," which is literally translated into English by the author:

(1) Any Ewhaer who has returned to the campus after a long vacation must have been surprised to see *so many changes* which happened in the campus during the last summer.

(2) Besides the conspicuous new building of College of Pharmacy remodeling of the back entrance gate, *almost all the buildings* in our university, including the Graduate School building, the Science building, the Student building, College of Education building, the Art building, and the Music building and so on, went through remodeling or improvement work of the inside of the buildings.

(3) In case of the Student building, they put *double-glassed windows* on the side of the road so that they could keep the noise away, *and put air conditioners* for

heating and cooling rooms. (4) *The department rooms* in the basement, for which everybody wanted a bigger one since their sizes were different, are also changed into nice rooms of the same sizes with walls and windows remodeled. (5) *The bathrooms* are also remodeled into bright and clean ones, (6) and *the trash cans* for recycling, which the cooperative union gave at the proper time, well matched the cleaned hallway.

(7) The reason why we have the impression that we entered the new buildings is not only due to *the newly painted walls* but to *the improvement of desks and chairs* of the classrooms. (8) We thank the school for making efforts to improve the environment and for the people who gave their labor while it was terribly hot during the summer.

(9) However, we want to take this opportunity to make some *pledges* for the environment of our university.

(10) Most of all, we worry how long indeed *these clean walls, desks, and chairs* will last. (11) Should we fine for *the scribbling on the desks*, or for *the disordered and illegal stickers and papers* on the bulletin boards or on the walls? (12) In addition to these, there are innumerable cases in which we can not but blame *the insensibility of our fellow students*. (13) The shame we feel when we see *the trash* thrown away beside the trash cans in the library lounges or in the student lounges, or *the empty boxes* piled up near the school store since they didn't get rid of them at a proper time. (14) It is especially undesirable, looking at it in the sense of the waste of energy, for us to *leave the fluorescent lamps turned on* all through the day in the empty classrooms.

(15) Another thing is *the campus* which is getting smaller and smaller. (16) We know that *the school authorities* have considered it very carefully, (17) but, even if we are happy with the new College of Pharmacy building on one hand, we can not but feel sad on the other hand since *the green land* in the campus is getting smaller that much. (18) grass. (19) We sincerely hope that *the extension or remodeling work* will be done without destroying the green land any more.

(20) However, the spatial environment is not the only *environment*. (21) Even if the noise from outside is kept away, there is no way of keeping students from making *noise* in the hallway during the lecture in the classroom. (22) Should we put *slogans* saying 'Let's be quiet in the hallway!' on every hallway? (23) Let's not forget the fact that the very beginning of all environment movement is *the beauty of intelligence* in which we should be conscious of others and try not to disturb them. (24) Only *the intelligence* which acts in small things can achieve the bigger ones.

#### Topical structure analysis

1. so many changes

#### Number of topics

1

2.	almost all the buildings	2
3.	double-glassed windows, ... and ... air conditioners	3
4.	The department rooms	4
5.	The bathrooms	5
6.	the trash cans	6
7.	the newly painted walls . the improvement of desks and chairs	7
8.	We	8
9.	pledges	9
10.	these clean walls, desks, and chairs	9
11.	the scribbling ... the disordered and illegal stickers and papers	10
12.	the insensibility of our fellow students	11
13.	the trash ... the empty boxes	12
14.	to leave the flourescent lamps turned on	13
15.	the campus	14
16.	the school authorities	15
17.	the green land	16
18.	the campus	16
19.	the extension or remodeling work	17
20.	environment	18
21.	noise	19
22.	slogans	20
23.	the beauty of intelligence	21
24.	the intelligence	21

<u>Parallel</u>	<u>Sequential</u>	<u>Extended Parallel</u>
23,	1,2    2,3	7,10
	3,4    4,5	15, 18
	5,6    6,7	
	7,8    8,9	
	10,11    11,12	
	12,13    13,14	
	14,15    16,17	
	18,19    19,20	
	20,21    21,22	
	22,23	
 <u>Total</u>	 <u>Total</u>	 <u>Total</u>
1	20	2

Example 4. An editorial written in English by Korean students: the whole editorial

from *The Sogang Herald* (December 9, 1993) with the headline, "'Unfair' Global Trade"

(1) As pressure to open market grows, *Korea* loses confidence in battling against the Western giants. (2) It appears that *the demand* of trade liberalization is influenced greatly without exception.

(3) Since the departure, *the government* has said to adhere to open anything but the rice-market seemed to change its attitude. (4) *Rice* is considered vital for the existence of the farm industry. (5) *Farming* plays an important role not only to supply substantial food but to preserve the national culture. (6) If *the government* gives up the rice farming, it would open up the domestic markets 14 other farm products as well.

(7) Regarding the trade liberalization, *twenty nine countries* including France, Japan, Swiss and Canada still adhere to limit their import items. (8) Not only that, *the United States* has limited their import limitations to 14 items.

(9) President, Clinton said that *the only way* for all countries to be wealthy is to expand global growth and to expand each country's fair share of global trade. (10) At the same time, *the policy* of the United States aims only to fulfill their interests not in maintaining 'fair share of global trade.' (11) *South Korea* has become one of its victims. (12) Grouping Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, *the United States and South Korea* are not on cooperative terms. (13) There is only *pressure* from one side.

(14) If the opening of market is inevitable in order to avoid economic isolation and to maintain ties with the international community, *various precautions* should be taken before opening. (15) When *countermeasures* are reasonable and acceptable to domestic farmers, people will not object.

(16) While 'rumors' that the government will open the rice-market gradually are in the air, *the President* is busy only avoiding his responsibility. (17) At first, *he* ought to reveal the truth and address his policy to farmers assertively. (18) It is also important *to listen* to people's voice. (19) As the Uruguay Round trade negotiations deadline of December 15 nears, *the Blue House* should not yield to the pressures of the Western giants, giving up even economic sovereign. (20) *The President* is asked to show a responsible attitude.

#### Topical structure analysis

#### Number of topics

1. Korea	1
2. the demand	2
3. the government	3
4. Rice	4
5. Farming	5
6. The government	5
7. twenty nine countries	6

Kyeongja Kim

8.	the United States	7
9.	the only way	8
10.	the policy of the United States	9
11.	South Korea	10
12.	the United States and South Korea	11
13.	pressure	12
14.	various precautions	13
15.	Countermeasures	14
16.	the President	15
17.	he	15
18.	to listen	16
19.	the Blue House	16
20.	The President	16

<u>Parallel</u>	<u>Sequential</u>	<u>Extended Parallel</u>
16,17	1,2 2,3	3,6
19,20	3,4 4,5	
17,19	6,7 7,8	
	8,9 9,10	
	10,11 11,12	
	12,13 13,14	
	14,15 15,16	
	17,18	
<u>Total</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Total</u>
2	15	2

I analyzed the topical structures with a total of 30 editorials and the result is as follows:

*1. Editorials written in Korean by Korean students*

```

=====
=====
no. of   No. of   no. of   no. of pro-   no. of   no. of
no. of   Editorials  T-units  topics   gressions parallel p. sequential p. Ext.
Par. P.
=====

```

Intercultural Communication Studies VI: 1 1996

Kyeongja Kim

	1	17	13	16	1	12	3
2	2	24		19	23	3	18
	3		20	17	19	2	16
	4		15	14	14	0	13
	5		18	15	17	0	14
	6		23	19	22	1	18
	7		24	19	23	3	18
	8		17	9	16	6	8
	9		20	16	19	1	14
	10		24	21	23	1	20
Total	22		202	162	192	18	151

2. Editorials written in English in Korea by Korean students

no. of Par. P.	no. of Editorials	No. of T-units	no. of topics	no. of pro- gressions	no. of parallel p.	no. of sequential p.	Ext.
	1	19	14	17	4	12	1
9	2		36	22	34	5	20
	3	13	12	12	0		11
	4	23	16	22	5	15	2
	5	33	23	32	6	22	4
	6	9	7	8	2	6	0
	7	18	15	17	2		14
	8	47	28	45	8	27	10
	9	20	16	19	2	15	2
	10	48	31	47	9	30	8
Total	38	266	184	253		43	172

*3. Editorials written in English by American students*

no. of Par. P.	no. of Editorials	No. of T-units	no. of topics	no. of pro- gressions	no. of parallel p.	no. of sequential p.	Ext.
1		23	15	22			3
2			7	4	7	5	14
3						0	4
3		22	10	21		6	9
6							
4	31	17	30	4	4	17	9
5	25	15	24	6	6	14	4
6	34	25	33	3	3	24	6
7	19	12	18	1	1	11	6
8	13	9	12	3	3	8	1
9	30	14	29	10	10	13	6
10	15	11	14	2			10
2							
Total	124	219	46	132		210	40

*4. Rates of topics, parallel progressions, sequential progressions, and extended parallel progressions (total number of topics of 10 articles/total number of t-units of 10 articles, total number of parallel progressions of 10 articles/total number of progressions of 10 articles, etc.)*

Parallel	No. Of Topics	Parallel	Sequential	Ext
Editorials written in Korean 12%	80.2%		9%	79%
Editorials written in English 15% by Korean stds.	69.2%		17%	68%

Editorials written in English by 22% American stds.	60.3%	19%	59%
--	-------	-----	-----

---

### *Analysis of Korean ESL students' writings*

#### *(1) Analysis of the placement of the main idea*

Since the genre of ESL students' writings is different from that of editorials, I looked at the placement of the main idea of each writing instead of the placement of a thesis summary. I divided the writings into two groups: writings for class assignment and those for journal. At first, I had no intention of dividing it, but while I analyzed the data, I found that there were some differences between them. The followings are the examples of the analysis of the data:

Example 1. An essay (for a class assignment) of a Korean ESL student with no title (24 years old, female, has lived in the U.S. for 3 months)

#### Introduction

Our body includes a lot of water. It makes up 85% of the blood, 70% of the muscles, and about 75% of the brain. Cells also include a lot of water. It is said that our body needs one-eighth of body weight of water. In the body, water has many functions. For example, regulating body temperature, carrying nutrients, removing toxins, discharging useless materials, and helping the many chemical reactions in our body. In addition to these functions, if you drink a lot of water, you keep your healthy beauty much longer. That is, drinking a lot of water causes not only health, but also losing weight, keeping the youth and making skin clean.

#### Body

The first of effects which result from the habit of drinking a lot of water is losing weight. In the France, drinking lots of water is the famous and successful diet method for a long time. It is believed that this method is easier than any other method. They just drink one-eighth of their weight of water everyday. They don't feel hungry and they eat less food. They also discharge a lot of water and extra materials as urine, sweat, bowel movement. In addition to, even though they consume less calories, they don't feel tired because of water.

The second effect of drinking a lot of water is prevention of the symptoms of senility. The symptoms of senility can be compared to a raisin. As we grow old, our cells lose

moistures. If cells will lose moistures, the function of cells will diminish. Therefore, if you drink regularly sufficient water, cells in your body can function much longer. As a result, the speed of the symptoms of senility will become slow.

The third effect of drinking a lot of water is making skin clean. Water removes toxins from body and provides cells with moistures. As you know, toxins in body result in some troubles in your skin. Therefore, if you drink a lot of water, your skin not only becomes clean, but also can maintain elasticity.

#### Conclusion

I'd like to suggest that all the females should drink regularly a lot of water for beauty and health. Many females choose dangerous diet methods for beauty. But, beauty without health can't exist. Nobody can be more beautiful than healthy females.

At first, this essay seems to have thesis statement in the 'introduction' part and so we may think that it has initial placement of thesis summary. The sentence *That is, drinking a lot of water causes not only health, but also losing weight, keeping the youth and making skin clean* can be seen as a thesis statement since the main idea of the sentence is supported by the next paragraphs, the 'body' part. The 'body' part gives detailed explanation of the effects of drinking a lot of water. But the conclusion is somewhat different. She suggests in conclusion that females should drink a lot of water to keep beauty and health. So, after all, the whole presentation of the essay seems to support this conclusion. If she were an American, she might present the conclusion in a different way.

How can we explain this? Considering the fact that this essay is written for class assignment, it might reflect what she has learned in the classroom. She must have received some instruction about writing (like all the students from whom I got data, she was enrolled in an intensive program). So, the overall organization of the essay is more like the American style - putting the main idea in the beginning and supporting it with the next paragraphs. But, still, she didn't totally throw away her L1 rhetorical pattern and transfers it in the conclusion part, putting the main idea at the end of the article. Or we might think that since she has been accustomed to the Korean rhetorical style (i.e., putting the main idea at the end of the writing), she might have felt that she missed something and that she should say something important, which can be considered as a conclusion, at the end of the essay - a kind of formulaic conclusion.

Example 2. An essay (from the journal) of a Korean ESL student with the title, "Aliens" (28 years old, male, has lived in the U.S. for 4 months)

I don't believe existence of aliens. Many people believe that U.F.O. is existed. They also took a photography. They presented U.F.O. photography as a proof. Many

scientist search for message from aliens. They are ready to receive extraterrestrial signals. They made radio antenna in order to search for existence of aliens.

No one prove existence of alien scientifically. They say only possibility. Certainly, no one can deny existence of alien confidently.

I believe Bible. The Bible say that there will be a presentation in the sky, the last millenium. The people who believe Bible find out strange smell and dead animal which is stripped in order to be offered by a sacrifice during tracing U.F.O..

I think that Satan play a trick with U.F.O.. Bible imply that the earth is only planet which is suitable for living in. But if people believe existence of U.F.O., they will suspect credibility of Bible.

This is similar to phenomenon which is related to people who believe the theory of evolution suspect credibility of Bible. The theory of evolution is only theory, not a fact. The scientist who believe the theory of evolution only say probability.

This essay is a little bit different from the former one. The author seems to follow his L1 (Korean) rhetorical style (consider that this essay is from his journal) - putting several facts first, which are not closely related, but loosely related to the main topic, and then presenting his opinion only at the later part of the essay: The title implies that this essay would be about aliens, and the first sentence seems to be the main idea. But as we read through the paragraphs, we find that this essay is in fact about the bible. The main idea is expressed in the sentence, "if people believe existence of U.F.O., they will suspect credibility of Bible," which appears in the later part of the essay. The last paragraph supports this idea, implying that he doesn't believe the theory of evolution as well as the existence of U.F.O. since he believes the bible.

I analysed a total of 8 essays (4 from class assignments and 4 from their journals). The result of the analyses of the placement of the main idea is that all of them, including the essays whose main ideas are expressed at the beginning but whose stronger main ideas are still expressed at the end of the essays again, have the main idea at the end of the essays.

## *(2) Analysis of topical structure*

I followed the same guidelines as I did in analyzing the editorials. The following is the example of the analyses of the data, where t-units are numbered and t-unit topics are italicized:

Example 1. An essay (for class assignment) of a Korean ESL student with no title (24 years old, female, has lived in the U.S. for 3 months)

### Introduction

(1) *Our body* includes a lot of water. (2) *It* makes up 85% of the blood, 70% of the muscles, and about 75% of the brain. (3) *Cells* also include a lot of water. (4) It is said that *our body* needs one-eighth of body weight of water. (5) In the body, *water* has many functions. (6) For *example*, regulating body temperature, carrying nutrients, removing toxins, discharging useless materials, and helping the many chemical reactions in our body. (7) In addition to these functions, if you drink a lot of *water*, you keep your healthy beauty much longer. (8) That is, *drinking a lot of water* causes not only health, but also losing weight, keeping the youth and making skin clean.

### Body

(9) *The first of effects* which result from the habit of drinking a lot of water is losing weight. (10) In the France, *drinking lots of water* is the famous and successful diet method for a long time. (11) It is believed that *this method* is easier than any other method. (12) *They* just drink one-eighth of their weight of water everyday. (13) *They* don't feel hungry (14) and *they* eat less food. (15) *They* also discharge a lot of water and extra materials as urine, sweat, bowel movement. (16) In addition to, even though *they* consume less calories, they don't feel tired because of water.

(17) *The second effect* of drinking a lot of water is prevention of the symptoms of senility. (18) *The symptoms* of senility can be compared to a raisin. (19) As we grow old, *our cells* lose moistures. (20) If *cells* will lose moistures, the function of cells will diminish. (21) Therefore, if you drink regularly sufficient water, *cells* in your body can function much longer. (22) As a result, *the speed of the symptoms of senility* will become slow.

(23) *The third effect* of drinking a lot of water is making skin clean. (24) *Water* removes toxins from body and provides cells with moistures. (25) As you know, *toxins* in body result in some troubles in your skin. (26) Therefore, if you drink a lot of water, *your skin* not only becomes clean, but also can maintain elasticity.

### Conclusion

(27) I'd like to suggest that *all the females* should drink regularly a lot of water for beauty and health. (28) *Many females* choose dangerous diet methods for beauty. (29) But, *beauty* without health can't exist. (30) Nobody can be more beautiful than *healthy females*.

#### Topical structure analysis

	number of topics
1. Our body	1
2. It	2
3. Cells	3
4. our body	3

5.	water	3	
6.	example		4
7.	water	4	
8.	drinking a lot of water		5
9.	The first effect		6
10.	drinking lots of water		6
11.	this method	6	
12.	They	7	
13.	they	7	
14.	they	7	
15.	They	7	
16.	they	7	
17.	The second effect	7	
18.	The symptoms		8
19.	our cells	8	
20.	cells	8	
21.	cells	8	
22.	The speed of the symptoms of senility		9
23.	The third effect	9	
24.	water	9	
25.	toxins		10
26.	your skin		11
27.	all the females		12
28.	many females		12
29.	beauty		
13			
30.	healthy females		
14			

<u>Parallel</u>	<u>Sequential</u>	<u>Extended Parallel</u>
10,11 12,13	1,2 2,3	1,4
13,14 14,15	5,6 7,8	2,5
15,16 19,20	8,9 11,12	5,7
20,21 27,28	17,18 21,22	8,10
	24,25 25,26	9,17
	26,27 28,29	17,23
	29,30	

<u>Total</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Total</u>
8	13	6

I analyzed the topical structure of a total of 8 essays and the result is as follows:

*1. Writings for class assignments*

no. of no. of Par. P.	no. of Editorials	No. of T-units	no. of topics	no. of pro- gressions	no. of parallel p.	no. of sequential p.	Ext.
1	48	22	46	14	20	12	
2	44	35	43	6	34	3	
3	30	14	27	8		13	
6							
4	24	12		25	2	14	
9							
Total	146		83	141	30		81
30							

*2. Writings from journals*

no. of no. of Par. P.	no. of Editorials	No. of T-units	no. of topics	no. of pro- gressions	no. of parallel p.	no. of sequential p.	Ext.
1	15	11	14	4	10	0	
2	22	14	21	5	13	3	
3	19	15	17	2	14	1	
4	27	18		26	5	17	
4							
Total	83	58	78	16		54	
8							

*3. Rates of topics, parallel progressions, sequential progressions, and extended parallel progressions (total number of topics of 10 articles/total number of t-units of 10 articles, total number of parallel progressions of 10 articles/total number of progressions of 10 articles, etc.)*

	No. Of Topics	Parallel	Sequential	Ext.
Parallel				
writings for class assignment	56.8%		21.3%	57.4%
				21.3%
writings from journals	69.9%	20.5%	69.2%	10.3%

#### FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In the analysis of the placement of a thesis summary, I have found that most of the editorials written by Korean students, whether they are written in Korean or in English, don't have a thesis summary at the initial position of the article. Usually they put several 'facts' first, which are usually not closely related but loosely related to the main discourse topic, and then induced the conclusion almost at the end of the article. The Korean ESL students' writings also have the main idea at the end of the essays. On the other hand, most of the editorials (7 out of 10) written by American students have a thesis summary in the initial part of the article. Usually they put the thesis statement first and then supported it with the following paragraphs. However, sometimes it was hard for me to find (or decide) thesis statements in the editorials as well as in the ESL students' writings.

In the analysis of the topical structure, I have found that the editorials written by American students employ more parallel and extended parallel progressions than Korean students. Therefore, the total number of topics per article is smaller than that of Korean students' editorials. The editorials written by Korean students, on the other hand, had more topics per article than those written by American students and employed more sequential progressions and, in general, the sequences of topics are not closely related to the main discourse topic or to the previous sentence topics. So, what Kaplan (1966) observed about Korean writings, "... circles or gyres turn around the subject and show it from a variety of tangential views, but the subject is never looked at directly," (10) seems to be true to some degree.

When the American students put the thesis summary at the end of the article, they, like Korean students, also put several facts at the beginning. However, their 'facts' are usually related to the main discourse topic or to the previous topics. On the other hand, Korean students used more unrelated (or loosely related) topics. It may be due to the fact that, in Korea, they usually assume that readers already know some facts about a topic. That is, they think that if the writer repeats what is already clear,

the reader may feel bored. Also, it might be explained in terms of what Hinds (1987) says, "reader versus writer responsibility." That is, it is the reader who is responsible for interpreting a text. As Koons (1986; quoted in Hinds (1990:100)) pointed out, "No matter how loosely paragraphs or sentences are connected to each other, Korean readers may try to connect each paragraph or sentence to the main idea which is stated in the beginning as a title."

There seems to be some difference between editorials written in Korean and in English by Korean students. I have found editorials written in English by Korean students use a little more parallel and extended parallel progressions than those written in Korean. This may mean that Korean students, when they write in English, might sometimes follow English rhetorical patterns. But since there is no big difference in the placement of a thesis summary, we can not definitely say that this is true. In general, it seems that the Korean students, when they write in L2, i.e. in English, employ L1 writing strategy in organizing their ideas even if they follow, to some degree, English writing patterns.

In the analysis of the ESL students' writings, I have found that the writings in English by Korean ESL students tend to show some transfer of Korean rhetorical style. It is interesting that there is some difference between the writings for class assignment and those from journals. The writings for class assignments have more parallel progressions and extended parallel progressions than the writings from their journals and so have less topics per essay. This seems to show the fact that they reflect what they have learned in the classroom in the U. S.

#### LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The main problem of this study is in the fact that deciding thesis statements (and thesis summaries) and topics of sentences largely depends on the researcher's view. As Tirkkonen-Condit and Lieflander-Koistinen (1989) point out, the decision of a thesis or a thesis summary is pragmatic. It depends on the content of a text and it can be determined only with a careful reading of the entire text. Decision of sentence topics is also the same. So, in spite of the fact that I carefully referred to the definitions and examples from authoritative books, this study might still have been subjected by the view of the author, affecting the reliability of the study.

Topical structure analysis has been used mainly to analyze the quality of writings in English. What the researchers have found is that the high quality writings contain more parallel and extended parallel progressions and that they also have closely related sequential progressions. I employed it to compare different rhetorical patterns in different languages. Till now, I couldn't find references about topical structure analysis in comparing different rhetorical patterns. So, I'm afraid if I did it in the right way and if the results might be reliable, but I'm glad I could find some interesting facts in spite of some limitations of the study.

## CONCLUSION

From this study, we can see that the rhetorical patterns in Korean and English are different from each other and that L2 learners, to some degree, transfer their L1 rhetorical style into their L2 when they write in L2. To explain the different rhetorical patterns, we might need the knowledge of cultural and historical backgrounds of each country. However, since it is not the main concern of the present study, I will present my conclusion here. What, then, is the meaning of this study? I'm not so sure about this question. It seems, at least, that the writing teachers of foreign languages need to be aware of the fact that each society has its own rhetorical pattern and that L2 learners, at least at the beginning, may transfer their L1 rhetorical patterns when they write in L2 (for example, if the teacher doesn't know the Korean rhetorical style, he or she may think that Korean students' writings are poor since they are loosely organized). We can not say or decide yet which is better. But, as some writing teachers say, if L2 learners want to succeed in their target language, they may need to learn everything in the target language, including the rhetorical patterns of the language, since even only being aware of the different rhetorical styles may help them use the style appropriate for the audience they are writing for.

Also, for further research, if we work with other people in this kind of study, for example, in deciding a thesis summary or sentence topics, we might be able to get more objective and accurate results.

**Note:** There are 30 editorials, including the ones literally translated into English from Korean, in the full study. If you want to see the full version, please write to the author at the address given in this issue.

## References

- Cerniglia, Constance S., Medsker, Karen L. and Connor, Ulla  
1990 Improving coherence by using computer-assisted instruction. In Ulla Connor and Ann M. Johns (Eds.), *Coherence in Writing: Research and Pedagogical Perspectives*. (pp.229-41). Alexandria, Virginia: TESOL, Inc.
- Connor, Ulla

Kyeongja Kim

1984 A study of cohesion and coherence in English as a second language students' writing. *Papers in Linguistics*, 17 (3), 301-16.

1990 Linguistic/Rhetorical measures for international persuasive student writing. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 24(1), 67-87.

1996 *Contrastive Rhetoric: Cross-cultural Aspects of Second Language Writing*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge UP.

Connor, Ulla and Schneider, Melanie

1990 Analyzing topical structure in ESL essays: not all topics are equal. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 12, 411-27.

Connor, Ulla and Kaplan, Robert B. (Eds.)

1987 *Writing Across Languages: Analysis of L2 Text*. Reading, Mass: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc.

Cooper, Charles R.

1983 Procedures for describing written texts. In Peter Mosenthal, Lynne Tamor and Sean A. Walmsley (Eds.), *Research on Writing: Principles and Methods*. (pp. 287- 313). New York: Longman Inc.

Dijk, T.A. van

1980 *Macrostructures. An Interdisciplinary Study of Global Structures in Discourse, Interaction and Cognition*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Eggington, William G.

1987 Written academic discourse in Korean: implications for effective communication. In Connor & Kaplan, pp. 153-68.

Grimes, J.E.

1975 *The Thread of Discourse*. Janua Linguarum, Series Minor, 207. The Hague, Mouton.

Hinds, John

1987 Reader versus writer responsibility: a new typology. In Connor & Kaplan, pp. 141-52.

1990 Inductive, deductive, quasi-inductive: expository writing in Japanese, Korean, Chinese, and Thai. In Ann M. John and Ulla Connor (Eds.), *Coherence in Writing: Research and Pedagogical Perspectives*. (pp. 89-109). Alexandria, Virginia: TESOL, Inc.

Kaplan, Robert B.

1966 Cultural thought patterns in inter-cultural education. *Language Learning*, 16, 1-20.

Lautamatti, Liisa

1978 Observations on the development of the topic in simplified discourse. In Viljo Kohonen and Nils Erik Enkvist (Eds.), *Text Linguistics, Cognitive Learning and Language Teaching*. (pp. 71-104). Suomen Sovelletun

Kyeongja Kim

Kielitieteen Yhdistyksen Julkaisu, no. 22. Turku, Finland: Afinla.

- 1987 Observations on the development of the topic of simplified discourse. In Connor & Kaplan, pp. 87-114.

Phelps, L. W.

- 1985 Dialectics of coherence: toward an integrative theory. *College English*, 47, 12-29.

Scarcella, Robib C.

- 1984 How writers orient their readers in expository essays: a comparative study of native and non-native English writers. *TESOL Quarterly*, 18 (4), 671-87.

Tirkkonen-Condit, Sonja and Luise Lieflander-Koistinen

- 1989 Argumentation in Finnish versus English and German Editorials. In M. Kusch and H. Schroder (Eds.), *Text, Interpretation, Argumentation*. (pp. 173-81). Hamburg, Germany: Helmut BuskeVerlag.

Tomlin, R. S.

- 1985 Foreground-background information and the syntax of subordination. *Text*, 5 (1-2), 85-122.

Witte, Stephen P.

- 1983 Topical structure and revision: an exploratory study. *College Composition and Communication*, 34 (3), 313-41.